

The Requirements and Necessities of Criminalizing Abortion in Iranian Law and the Youthful Population Law in Light of International Legal Frameworks

Jalal. Shirmohammadi¹, Babak. Pourghahramani^{2*}, Jamal. Beigi²

¹ PhD student, Department of Criminal Law and Criminology, Maragheh Branch, Islamic Azad University, Maragheh, Iran

² Associate Professor, Department of Criminal Law and Criminology, Maragheh Branch, Islamic Azad University, Maragheh, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: Pourghahramani@iau.ir

Received: 2025-01-26	Revised: 2025-04-08	Accepted: 2025-04-14	Published: 2025-07-01
EDITOR: Eman Shenouda  Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran. Email: ens01@fayoum.edu.eg			
REVIEWER 1: Mehmet Çevik  Department of Social Sciences, Ankara University, Türkiye. Email: mehmetÇevik@asbu.edu.tr			
REVIEWER 2: Nabeel Bani-Hani  Faculty of Education Specialization, Wasit University, Wasit, Iraq. Email: nabeelhani@uowasit.edu.iq			

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The section quoting “Grand Ayatollah Khamenei considers abortion to be forbidden (haram)” could benefit from comparative jurisprudential context—cite at least one differing opinion from other Shi’a authorities or Sunni jurists to provide a balanced legal-religious perspective.

In “Abortion and Fetal Expulsion”, definitions mix legal and medical terminology. It would improve precision to separate medical definitions (e.g., WHO) from legal ones and include a citation or Iranian statutory definition where applicable.

The Literature Review section lists prior studies sequentially (e.g., Javadi, Fallah Nejad, Ahmadi) but lacks synthesis. Consider creating a comparative table or narrative integration summarizing what each study contributes and how the present research fills the identified gaps.

Paragraphs under “Abortion in Iranian Law” and later in “Family Protection and Youthful Population Law” repeat the same statutory references (Articles 56, 73, 718). Streamline these sections by consolidating legislative analysis to avoid redundancy and improve readability.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The paragraph stating “this subject is novel, practical, and underexplored” is too general. Specify which dimensions (legal, ethical, procedural, or international comparative) have been underexplored in prior Iranian or comparative studies to clearly justify the originality of the work.

The review ends with “Jebeli (2003)” —most references are dated before 2020. To reflect current developments, incorporate recent international debates (e.g., U.S. Supreme Court’s *Dobbs v. Jackson*, WHO 2023 abortion guideline updates) to strengthen contemporary relevance.

The transition between “The Legal Nature of Abortion” and “Abortion in Iranian Law” is abrupt. Add a bridging paragraph explaining how the global health implications discussed lead to the need for a focused analysis of Iranian law.

The claim “Iran is among the developing nations where women face religious and cultural opposition to abortion while also suffering from health risks associated with unsafe abortions” requires citation or data support—consider including WHO, Ministry of Health, or demographic statistics.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor’s decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief’s decision: Accepted.