

OPEN PEER REVIEW

# A Critical Analysis of Imamiyyah Jurisprudence and Iranian Law Regarding the Exploitation of Groundwater with Emphasis on Environmental Obligations and the Principle of La-Zarar

Atieh. Araghi<sup>1</sup>, Mohammad. Sepehri<sup>1\*</sup>, Sayed Abolfazl. Razavi<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Department of History, CT.C., Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

<sup>2</sup> Department of History, Faculty of Humanities, Kharazmi University, Tehran, Iran

\* Corresponding author email address: 6529705805@iau.ir

Received: 2025-07-03	Revised: 2025-11-23	Accepted: 2025-11-30	Initial Publish: 2025-12-02	Final Publish: 2026-09-01
<b>EDITOR:</b> Ghasem Eftekhari Associate Professor, Department of Political Science, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran. Email: eftekhari@ut.ac.ir				
<b>REVIEWER 1:</b> Jingjing Wang Law School, Peking University (PKU), Peking, China. Email: jingwang@vip.sina.com				
<b>REVIEWER 2:</b> Abdus Samad Assistant Professor, Department of Law, AWKUM, Pakistan. Email: abdussamad@awkum.edu.pk				

## 1. Round 1

### 1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

When you state “The establishment of a specialized police force for children and adolescents...”, please clarify whether the problem of absent specialized institutions is structural (policy design) or procedural (implementation). A theoretical distinction would improve analytical depth.

While the conceptual discussion is solid, it lacks empirical grounding. Integrate evidence from pilot programs at the Police University or NAJA training schools to illustrate feasibility.

This recommendation could be made more actionable by introducing a model (e.g., Kirkpatrick’s four-level training evaluation framework) and suggesting its application to the Juvenile Police.

Expand the conceptual link between accountability mechanisms and citizen trust. You may include models from administrative ethics or public administration literature to support the causal claim.

The four-part typology (administrative, financial, behavioral, normative) is well-structured. However, each dimension should include a specific operational example—e.g., financial audits, disciplinary boards, or behavioral codes.

The narrative could be enhanced by adding a visual schematic or table summarizing decision flows and their correspondence to governance principles.

While the conclusion summarizes key points, it does not clearly articulate the practical implications for policymakers. Add a sentence specifying how your findings could inform Ministry of Interior or Judiciary reforms.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

## 1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The description of Article 31 is largely narrative. Expand the analysis to examine whether Article 31 provides operational independence or maintains hierarchical subordination to the general police.

Include comparative insight by referencing international instruments such as the UN Model Law on Juvenile Justice or Beijing Rules. This would strengthen the study's alignment with global governance norms.

The statement "When organizational authoritarianism is treated as a core value..." is perceptive, but requires supporting data. Cite empirical findings or internal police surveys to substantiate the prevalence of authoritarian structures in NAJA.

This paragraph provides strong critique but would benefit from jurisprudential grounding. Include references to decisions by the Administrative Justice Court or relevant constitutional opinions that interpret Clause 'p'.

The phrase "Rule of law is the basis of legitimacy in police activity" would be stronger if supported with constitutional or statutory citations (e.g., Article 22 or 32 of the Iranian Constitution) that concretize this claim.

The text mentions several laws but lacks chronological or hierarchical ordering. Provide a table summarizing statutes, their enactment dates, and relevance to juvenile policing.

The analysis of hierarchical norms is important. Strengthen it by discussing how cultural reform could be institutionalized through continuous training, not merely top-down directives.

The manuscript asserts that "the Juvenile Police can be a model for governance reform," but offers no theoretical justification. Link this argument to the principles of new public management or good governance theory to demonstrate conceptual alignment.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

## 2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.