

OPEN PEER REVIEW

# Barriers and Challenges to Establishing Political Stability in Afghanistan (2001-2024)

Sayed Alireza. Hossaini<sup>1\*</sup>  AbbasAli. Rahbar<sup>2</sup>  Ebrahim. Barzegar<sup>3</sup> 

<sup>1</sup> Phd Student of Political Science, Allameh Tabataba'i University, Tehran, Iran

<sup>2</sup> Professor of Political Science, Department of Political Science, Faculty of Law and Political Sciences, Allameh Tabataba'i University, Tehran, Iran

<sup>3</sup> Professor of Political Science, Political Thoughts Department of Political Science, Faculty of Law and Political Sciences, Allameh Tabataba'i University, Tehran, Iran

\* Corresponding author email address: sayed.alireza.hossaini110@gmail.com

Received: 2024-05-25

Revised: 2024-08-20

Accepted: 2023-08-23

Published: 2024-12-01

## EDITOR:

Pinar Reisoglu 

Faculty of Social Sciences, Recep Tayyip Erdogan University, Rize, Turkey

pinarreisoglu@erdogan.edu.tr

## REVIEWER 1:

Shehzad Raj 

School of Law, Universiti Geomatika Malaysia, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia

shehzadraj@geomatika.edu.my

## REVIEWER 2:

Jingjing Wang 

Law School, Peking University (PKU), Peking, China

jingwang@vip.sina.com

## 1. Round 1

### 1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The sentence "The research hypothesis suggests that the fundamental factors contributing to political instability include: a mosaic society, the lack of a unified nation..." lacks citation. Please provide references to support the identification of these factors.

The statement "The research method employed in this study is descriptive and analytical..." could benefit from a brief justification for choosing this method. Why was a descriptive and analytical approach chosen over other methodologies?

The sentence "Sanders' media-centric approach... is essentially a critical evaluation with a conceptual orientation" is vague. Please clarify what is meant by "conceptual orientation" and provide examples of how this approach has been utilized in studies.

The criteria listed by Sanders for political stability are critical to the study. However, it would be helpful to include a table or figure that visually summarizes these criteria for better clarity.

The sentence "Afghanistan was established in 1747 and declared its independence in 1919..." could be supported with historical references or citations to provide stronger evidence for the historical timeline presented.

The sentence "The most significant consequences of the Cold War..." introduces a critical analysis. However, the discussion lacks references to Cold War literature that supports these claims. Consider adding citations from Cold War studies.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

### 1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The mention of "David Sanders' theory of political instability patterns" is crucial to the study's framework. However, the introduction would benefit from a brief summary of the key aspects of Sanders' theory and how they apply to Afghanistan.

The sentence "Various theories have been proposed concerning political stability and instability..." could be enhanced by providing a more comprehensive comparison of these theories before focusing on Sanders' approach. This would help set a clearer context for the choice of theory.

The discussion on the "Institutional Continuity Approach" could be expanded to include examples of how this approach has been applied in other contexts or countries. This would strengthen the argument for its relevance to Afghanistan.

The discussion on Zahir Shah's reign mentions the lack of political reform. It would be beneficial to include specific examples of failed reforms or policies to substantiate this claim.

The phrase "ethnic nationalism and geographic dispersion of ethnic groups in specific regions..." is a key point. Please elaborate on how geographic dispersion has specifically contributed to political instability in Afghanistan.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

## 2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.